A. Clifford Edwards
Triel D. Culver
A. Christopher Edwards
John W. Edwards
EDWARDS, FRICKLE & CULVER

1648 Poly Drive, Suite 206 Billings, MT 59102

Telephone: (406) 256-8155 Facsimile: (406) 256-8159

Bruce A. Americus (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Matthew F. Burger (*Pro Hac Vice*)
BUCHANAN INGERSOLL & ROONEY PC
One Oxford Centre
301 Grant Street, 20th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
Telephone: (412) 562-8800

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MONTANA BILLINGS DIVISION

SIGNAL PEAK ENERGY, LLC,

Plaintiff,

VS.

EASTERN MONTANA MINERALS, INC., and MUSSELSHELL RESOURCES, LLC,

Defendants and Counterclaim Plaintiffs,

VS.

SIGNAL PEAK ENERGY, LLC; FIRSTENERGY CORP.; FIRSTENERGY VENTURES CORP.; Case Number: CV 12-55-BLG-RFC

JOINDER IN COUNTERCLAIM DEFENDANTS PINESDALE LLC AND GUNVOR GROUP LTD.'S MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

Filed by Signal Peak Energy, LLC, FirstEnergy Corp., FirstEnergy Ventures Corp., FirstEnergy Generation Corp., Boich Companies, LLC, WMB Marketing Ventures, LLC, Global Coal Sales Group, LLC, and Global Mining Holding Company, LLC FIRSTENERGY GENERATION CORP.; GUNVOR GROUP, LTD.; PINESDALE LLC; BOICH COMPANIES, LLC; WMB MARKETING VENTURES, LLC; GLOBAL COAL SALES GROUP, LLC; and GLOBAL MINING HOLDING COMPANY, LLC,

Counterclaim Defendants.

## JOINDER IN COUNTERCLAIM DEFENDANTS PINESDALE LLC AND GUNVOR GROUP LTD.'S MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

Counterclaim Defendants Signal Peak Energy, LLC ("SPE"), FirstEnergy
Corp., FirstEnergy Ventures Corp., FirstEnergy Generation Corp., Boich
Companies, LLC, WMB Marketing Ventures, LLC, Global Coal Sales Group,
LLC, and Global Mining Holding Company, LLC (collectively "Joining
Defendants") hereby join in Counterclaim Defendants Pinesdale LLC
("Pinesdale") and Gunvor Group Ltd.'s ("Gunvor") Motion for Protective Order,
averring as follows:

- 1. The Joining Defendants filed Motions to Dismiss the Counterclaims asserted by Eastern Montana Minerals, Inc. and Musselshell Resources, LLC (collectively "EMM") pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b) ("Motions").
  - 2. Briefing of the Motions was completed on August 29, 2012.

- 3. The Motions present dispositive questions of law for resolution by the Court. They make clear that this Court lacks personal jurisdiction over all but three of the Joining Defendants, and that there is no legal basis to expand this case from a contractual dispute concerning the basis for calculating Royalties pursuant to a 2008 Coal Lease between SPE and EMM, into a tort-based action involving nine separate entities that are not parties to the Coal Lease. Accordingly, discovery in this matter before the Motions are decided would be premature, burdensome and inefficient.
- 4. Pinesdale and Gunvor have moved this Court for a Protective Order, pursuant to Rule 26(c), to stay discovery until such time as the Court decides the Motions to Dismiss.
- 5. Joining Defendants incorporate herein by reference any and all documents filed, and all legal arguments raised in support of, Pinesdale and Gunvor's Motion for Protective Order.
- 6. The Joining Defendants believe that, once the Motions are resolved, there will remain before the Court a contract-based action between SPE and EMM that will involve a significantly more appropriately tailored and far less burdensome and costly discovery process.

Counsel for the Joining Defendants certifies that counsel for 7. Pinesdale and Gunvor has conferred with counsel for EMM, and that EMM opposes the Motion for Protective Order.

WHEREFORE, Counterclaim Defendants Signal Peak Energy, LLC, FirstEnergy Corp., FirstEnergy Ventures Corp., FirstEnergy Generation Corp., Boich Companies, LLC, WMB Marketing Ventures, LLC, Global Coal Sales Group, LLC, and Global Mining Holding Company, LLC respectfully request that the Court enter a protective order, pursuant to Rule 26(c), to stay all discovery until such time as the Court decides the Motions.

DATED this 14<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2012.

/s/ A. Clifford Edwards A. Clifford Edwards Triel D. Culver A. Christopher Edwards John W. Edwards EDWARDS, FRICKLE & CULVER 1648 Poly Drive, Suite 206 Billings, MT 59102 Telephone: (406) 256-8155 Facsimile: (406) 256-8159

Bruce A. Americus (*Pro Hac Vice*) Matthew F. Burger (*Pro Hac Vice*) **BUCHANAN INGERSOLL & ROONEY PC** One Oxford Centre 301 Grant Street, 20th Floor Pittsburgh, PA 15219

Telephone: (412) 562-8800

## Case 1:12-cv-00055-RFC Document 97 Filed 09/14/12 Page 5 of 6

Attorneys for Counterclaim Defendants Signal Peak Energy, LLC; FirstEnergy Corp.; FirstEnergy Ventures Corp.; FirstEnergy Generation Corp.; Boich Companies, LLC; WMB Marketing Ventures, LLC; Global Coal Sales Group, LLC; and Global Mining Holding Company, LLC

## **CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE**

Pursuant to Rule 7.1(d)(2)(e) of the U.S. District Court for the District of Montana, I certify that this document is printed with a proportionately spaced Times New Roman text typeface of 14 points; is double spaced; and the word count calculated by Word is 380 excluding the Caption, Table of Contents, Table of Authorities, Exhibit Index, and Certificate of Compliance.

Dated this 14<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2012.

/s/ A. Clifford Edwards
A. Clifford Edwards
Triel D. Culver
A. Christopher Edwards
John W. Edwards
EDWARDS, FRICKLE & CULVER
1648 Poly Drive, Suite 206
Billings, MT 59102
Telephone: (406) 256-8155

Facsimile: (406) 256-8159

Bruce A. Americus (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Matthew F. Burger (*Pro Hac Vice*)
BUCHANAN INGERSOLL & ROONEY PC
One Oxford Centre
301 Grant Street, 20th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
Telephone: (412) 562-8800

Attorneys for Counterclaim Defendants
Signal Peak Energy, LLC; FirstEnergy
Corp.; FirstEnergy Ventures Corp.;
FirstEnergy Generation Corp.; Boich
Companies, LLC; WMB Marketing
Ventures, LLC; Global Coal Sales
Group, LLC; and Global Mining Holding
Company, LLC